

TREATMENT OF SCOTTISH HISTORY

197

Cromdale. Since Macaulay's narrative of these events was put together some new evidence has come to light. Most of the letters collected by Mark Napier in his life of Dundee were written before the Revolution, but there are some of this period in his book. Napier translates also long passages from the Latin epic on Dundee,, named the Grarneid, which was one of Macaulay's authorities.¹ This poem was edited by Mr. Alexander Murdoch for the Scottish History Society in iSSS. Macaulay also employed Memoirs of the War Carried On in Scotland and Ireland, 1689-1691, by Major-General Hugh Mackay, which was published by the Bannatyne Club in 1853, ^{anc}^ the Life of Major-General Mackay, by John Mackay of Rockfield, published by the same club in 1836. But many letters of Mackay's have been lately printed in the reports on the Manuscripts of the Dukes of Hamilton and Athole.

The study of the campaign has resulted in a number of controversies. Historians disagree about the site of the battle of Killiecrankie. Macaulay fixes on one spot₃ Mark Napier on another, Professor Terry on a third. Professor Terry says : ' Mackay's very minute topography leaves me no room to doubt that the sites which hitherto have been accepted for the battle are wrong. . . . Macaulay imagined that the battle was fought in the field where "

Claverhouse's
 Stone " is marked upon the accompanying
 map. That site
 has the sanction of the Ordnance Map of 1900.
 The most
 cursory reading of Mackay's narrative is
 sufficient to prove
 that that was the spot on which Mackay
 halted, and not
 that on which the battle was fought/ He
 then takes the
 site preferred by Mark Napier, and gives
 various reasons

¹IV, 1607 (xlii). Macaulay's criticisms (pp. 1597-8) of the
 Memoirs of the
 Life of Sir Ewan Cameron and the Historical and
 Genealogical Account of
 the Clan Maclean also deserve attention.